

Professor Assaf Likhovski

**Major Debates in Israeli Historiography**

History 191L-2

Fall 2009. Tuesday 14:00-16:50

Dodd Hall 154

Course website: <http://classes.sscnet.ucla.edu/course/view/09F-HIST191L-2>

Office Hours:

Law School Room 3437

Thursday 13:00-14:00

Email: [likhovski@law.ucla.edu](mailto:likhovski@law.ucla.edu)

**Description**

Israeli history is highly contested. History plays a role in legitimizing the positions of the parties to the Arab-Israeli conflict, but it also serves as the background of major controversies within Israeli society. Studying Israeli history therefore offers a chance to explore the contribution and impact, the problems and pitfalls, of writing history in a multi-ethnic and complex society where the past really matters.

In recent decades, historians and social scientists have produced a large body of studies dealing with the history of the mandatory era and the early state period, moving from more traditional fields such as military and diplomatic history to new territories ranging from the legal history to the study of everyday life or governmentality. This seminar will explore some of the recent debates and trends in Israeli historiography. Among the topics that will be discussed are the 1948 war and the new historians; Critical sociology and class, gender and ethnic conflicts; Zionism, Colonialism and Orientalism; The formation of the Israeli identity and of the Israeli state; Histories of Jewish-Arab relations and civil rights discourse in the 1950s; Memory and representation; Consumption, hygiene and the body.

**Course requirements**

1. Attendance and active participation in class discussions are essential.
2. A weekly written summary of one of the required readings due at each class session. The length of the summary should be approximately 1-2 pages. Students will be required to submit 5 summaries.
3. Depending on enrollment, students will be asked to participate in one or two debates/presentations based on the required reading.
4. The major written assignment will be a 10-15 page long research paper to be submitted at the end of the course (December 1, 2009). Paper topics must be approved by me. The topic should be chosen by the third week of the course (October 13, 2009).
- 5 Grades will be based on class participation (30%), discussion papers (20%), and final paper (50%).

## Syllabus

[Note: the dates are tentative and depend on the pace of discussion in class]

### **1. September 29, 2009: The 1948 War and the New Historians**

#### Readings:

Benny Morris, "Israel Confronts its Past," in *Making Israel* (Benny Morris ed., Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2007), 11-28.

Yoav Gelber, "The History of Zionist Historiography: From Apologetics to Denial," in Benny Morris *Making Israel* (Benny Morris ed., Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2007), 47-80.

Ilan Pappé, "The Tantura Case in Israel: The Katz Research and Trial," *Journal of Palestine Studies* 30 (2001): 19-39.

Yoav Gelber, *Palestine 1948: War, Escape and the Emergence of the Palestinian Refugee Problem* (2<sup>nd</sup> ed., Brighton: Sussex Academic Press, 2006), 319-327.

### **2. October 6, 2009: Histories of Class and Ethnic Conflict**

#### Readings:

Uri Ram, "The Future of the Past in Israel: A Sociology of Knowledge Approach," in *Making Israel* (Benny Morris ed., Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2007), 202-230.

Moshe Lissak, "'Critical' and 'Establishment' Sociology in Israel's Academic Community: Ideological Clashes or Academic Discourse?" in *Making Israel* (Benny Morris ed., Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2007), 178-201.

Zeev Sternhell, *The Founding Myths of Israel: Nationalism, Socialism, and the Making of the Jewish State* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1999), 3-46.

Ella Shohat, "Sephardim in Israel: Zionism from the Standpoint of its Jewish Victims," *Social Text* 19/20 (1988): 1-35.

Yaron Tsur, "Israeli Historiography and the Ethnic Problem," in *Making Israel* (Benny Morris ed., Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2007), 231-277.

#### **Debate I: Mizrahi Jews and Zionism (Shohat v. Tsur)**

### **3. October 13, 2009: Colonialism, Orientalism and Zionism**

#### Readings:

Edward Said, *Orientalism* (New York: Pantheon, 1978), 31-45, 284-288.

David Cannadine, *Ornamentalism: How the British Saw their Empire* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001), 3-24, 71-82.

Theodor Herzl, *Old New Land* (Lotte Levensohn trans., New York: Herzl Press, 1960), pp. 42-50, 53-60, 115-126, 132-154, 192-199.

Gershon Shafir, *Land, Labor and the Origins of the Israeli-Palestinian Conflict, 1882-1914* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989), 1-21.

Ran Aharonson, "Settlement in Eretz Israel — A Colonialist Enterprise? 'Critical' Scholarship and Historical Geography," *Israel Studies* 1 (1996): 214-229.

**Paper Topic: Please submit (by 10/13 at 10:00am) a one page description of your paper topic, including a brief bibliography. You can send the description by email (likhovski@law.ucla.edu).**

#### **4. October 20, 2009: The Formation of Israeli Identity**

##### Readings:

Itamar Even-Zohar, "The Emergence of Native Hebrew culture in Palestine, 1882-1948, in *Essential papers on Zionism*, (Jehuda Reinharz and Anita Shapira eds, New York: New York University Press, 1996), 727-744.

Oz Almog, *The Sabra: The Creation of a New Jew* (Haim Watzman trans, Berkeley: University of California Press, 2000), 1-22.

Assaf Likhovski, *Law and Identity in Mandate Palestine* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2006), 127-153.

Sandra Sufian, "Defining National Medical Borders: Medical Terminology and the Making of Hebrew. Medicine," in *Reapproaching Borders: New Perspectives on the Study of Israel-Palestine* (Sandra Sufian and Mark LeVine eds., Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield, 2007), 97-120.

#### **5. October 27, 2009: The Early Israeli State: Culture and Governmentality**

##### Readings

Eli Salzberger and Fania Oz-Salzberger, "The Secret German Sources of the Israeli Supreme Court," *Israel Studies* 3 (1999): 159-192.

Yoram Shachar. "From Divine Providence to the Rock of Israel: Two Declarations of Independence," *Theoretical Inquiries in Law* 10 (2009): 581-618.

Anat E. Leibler, "Statisticians' Ambition: Governmentality, Modernity and National Legibility," *Israel Studies* 9 (2004): 121-149.

Assaf Likhovski, "Tax Compliance and Modernity," *Law and Social Inquiry* 32 (2007): 665-700.

#### **6. November 3, 2009: Individualism and Rights Discourse in the 1950s**

H.C. 10/49 Zeev v. Acting District Commissioner of the Urban Area of Tel Aviv, 1 *Selected Judgements of the Supreme Court of Israel* 68-75.

H.C. 73/53 Kol Haam Co. Ltd. v. Ministry of the Interior, 1 *Selected Judgements of the Supreme Court of Israel* 90-121.

Menachem Mautner, "Law and Culture in Israel: The 1950s and the 1980s," in *The History of Law in a Multicultural Society: Israel 1917-1967*, (Ron Harris et al. eds, Dartmouth: Ashgate, 2002), 175-214.

Pnina Lahav, *Judgment in Jerusalem: Chief Justice Simon Agranat and the Zionist Century* (Berkeley, University of California Press, 1997), pp. 90-112.

Ron Harris, "Legitimizing the Imprisonment of Poor Debtors: Lawyers, Legislators, Judges" in *The History of Law in a Multicultural Society: Israel 1917-1967*, (Ron Harris et al. eds, Dartmouth: Ashgate, 2002), 217-241.

## **7. November 10, 2009: Land in 1950s Israel**

### Readings

Benny Morris, *Israel's Border Wars, 1949-1956: Arab Infiltration, Israeli Retaliation, and the Countdown to the Suez War* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1993), 2-5, 28-34.

Jeremy Forman and Alexandre (Sandy) Kedar, "Colonialism, Colonization and Land Law in Mandate Palestine: The Zor al-Zarqa / Barrat Qisarya Land Disputes in Historical Perspective," *Theoretical Inquiries in Law* 4 (2003): 491-539.

Alexandre (Sandy) Kedar, "The Jewish State and the Arab Possessor: 1948 - 1967," in *The History of Law in a Multicultural Society: Israel 1917-1967*, (Ron Harris et al. eds, Dartmouth: Ashgate, 2002), 317-360.

Yifat Holzman-Gazit, "Mass Immigration, Housing Supply and Supreme Court Jurisprudence of Land Expropriation in Early Statehood," in *The History of Law in a Multicultural Society: Israel 1917-1967*, (Ron Harris et al. eds, Dartmouth: Ashgate, 2002), 273-300.

### **Debate II: Law and Power in the 1950s (Kedar v. Holzman-Gazit)**

## **8. November 17, 2009: Memory and Representation**

### Readings:

Yael Zerubavel, *Recovered Roots: Collective Memory and the Making of Israeli National Tradition* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1995), 13-36, 48-59.

Nadia Abu el-Haj, *Facts on the Ground: Archaeological Practice and Territorial Self-Fashioning in Israeli Society* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2001), 1-21, 73-98.

Tamar Berger, "Sleep, Teddy Bear, Sleep Independence Park, Petach Tikva: An Israeli Realm of Memory," *Israel Studies* 7 (2002): 1-32.

Anita Shapira, "The Holocaust: Private Memories, Public Memory," *Jewish Social Studies* 4 (1998): 40-56.

Idith Zertal, *Israel's Holocaust and the Politics of Nationhood* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005), 52-90.

**Debate III: Israel and the Memory of the Holocaust in the 1950s (Shapira v. Zertal)**

**9. November 24, 2009: Consumption and the History of Everyday Life**

Readings:

Tom Segev, *1949: The First Israelis* (New York: Henry Holt, 1998), 296-323.

Orit Rozin, "Food Identity and Nation Building in Israel's Formative Years," *Israel Studies Forum* 21 (2006): 52-80.

Anat Helman, "Taking the Bus in 1920s and 1930s Tel-Aviv," *Middle Eastern Studies* 42 (2006): 625-640.

Anat Helman, "Hollywood in an Israeli Kibbutz: Going to the Movies in 1950s Afikim," *Historical Journal of Film, Radio and Television* 23 (2003), 153-163.

**10. December 1, 2009: Body and Hygiene**

Readings:

Dafna Hirsch, "'Interpreters of Occident to the Awakening Orient': The Jewish Public Health Nurse in Mandate Palestine," *Comparative Studies in Society and History* 50 (2008): 227-255.

Anat Helman, "Cleanliness and Squalor in Inter-War Tel Aviv," *Urban History* 31 (2004): 72-99.

Nadav Davidovich and Shifra Shvarts, "Health and Hegemony: Preventive Medicine, Immigrants and the Israeli Melting Pot," *Israel Studies* 9 (2004): 150-179.

Oz Almog, "From Blorit to Ponytail: Israeli Culture Reflected in Popular Hairstyles," *Israel Studies* 8 (2003): 82-117.

## Some Additional Materials

### **General Surveys**

Benny Morris, *Righteous Victims: A History of the Zionist-Arab Conflict, 1881-1999* (New York: Vintage Books, 2001).

Howard M. Shachar, *A History of Israel: From the Rise of Zionism to Our Time* (3rd ed., New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 2007).

Avi Shlaim, *The Iron Wall: Israel and the Arab World* (New York: W.W. Norton, 2000).

### **1. The 1948 War and the New Historians**

Efraim Karsh, *Fabricating Israeli History: The "New Historians"* (2nd rev. ed., London: Frank Cass, 2000).

Baruch Kimmerling, "Academic History Caught in the Cross Fire: The Case of Israeli-Jewish Historiography," *History and Memory* 7 (1995): 41-65.

Benny Morris, *The Birth of the Palestinian Refugee Problem Revisited* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004).

Benny Morris, *1948: A History of the First Arab-Israeli War* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2008).

Ilan Pappé, *History of Modern Palestine: One Land, Two Peoples* (2nd ed., Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2006).

*The War for Palestine: Rewriting the History of 1948* (Eugene L. Rogan and Avi Shlaim eds., Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001).

### **2. Histories of Class and Ethnic Conflict**

Shulamit Carmi and Henry Rosenfeld, "The Emergence of Militaristic Nationalism in Israel," *International Journal of Politics, Culture, and Society* 3 (1989): 5-49.

Dan Horowitz and Moshe Lissak, *Troubles in Utopia: The Overburdened Polity of Israel* (Albany: University of New York Press, 1989).

Uri Ram, *The Changing Agenda of Israeli Sociology : Theory, Ideology, and Identity* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1995).

Yehouda Shenhav, *The Arab Jews: A Postcolonial Reading of Nationalism, Religion, and Ethnicity* (Stanford, Stanford University Press, 2006).

Shlomo Swirski, *Israel: The Oriental Majority* (London: Zed Books, 1989).

### **3. Colonialism, Orientalism and Zionism**

Yoram Hazony, *The Jewish State: The Struggle for Israel's Soul* (New York: Basic Books, 2000).

Yaron Peleg, *Orientalism and the Hebrew Imagination* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2005).

Derek J. Penslar, *Israel in History: The Jewish state in Comparative Perspective* (London: Routledge, 2007).

*Israeli Historical Revisionism From Left to Right* (Anita Shapira and Derek J. Penslar eds., London: Routledge, 2003).

Gabriel Piterberg, *The Returns of Zionism: Myths, Politics and Scholarship in Israel* (London and New York: Verso, 2008).

*The Postzionism Debates: Knowledge and Power in Israeli Culture* (Laurence J. Silberstein ed., London: Routledge, 1999).

*Postzionism: A Reader* (Laurence J. Silberstein ed., Piscataway: Rutgers University Press, 2008).

S. Ilan Troen, "De-Judaizing the Homeland: Academic Politics in Rewriting the History of Palestine," *Israel Affairs* 13 (2007): 872–884.

### **4. The Formation of Israeli Identity**

Michael Berkowitz, *Zionist Culture and West European Jewry before the First World War* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993).

Baruch Kimmerling, *The Invention and Decline of Israeliness: State, Society and the Military* (Los Angeles and Berkeley: University of California Press, 2001).

Gershon Shafir and Yoav Peled, *Being Israeli: The Dynamics of Multiple Citizenship* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2002).

Arieh B. Saposnik, *Becoming Hebrew: The Creation of a Jewish National Culture in Ottoman Palestine* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2008).

Michael Stanislawski, *Zionism and the Fin de Siècle: Cosmopolitanism and Nationalism from Nordau to Jabotinsky* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2001).

### **5. The Early Israeli State: Culture and Governmentality**

Pnina Lahav, "The Supreme Court of Israel: Formative Years, 1948-1955," *Studies in Zionism* 11 (1990): 45-66.

Pnina Lahav, *Judgement in Jerusalem: Chief Justice Simon Agranat and the Zionist Century* (Berkeley: The University of California Press, 1997).

Pnina Lahav, "A Jewish State...to Be Known as the State of Israel?: Notes on Israeli Legal Historiography," *Law and History Review* 19 (2001): 387-444.

Assaf Likhovski, "Between 'Mandate' and 'State': Rethinking the Periodization of Israeli Legal History." *Journal of Israeli History* 19 (1998): 5-34.

Moshe Naor, "From Voluntary Funds to National Loans: The Financing of Israel's 1948 War Effort," *Israel Studies* 11 (2006): 62-82.

Tom Segev, *1949: The First Israelis* (New York: Free Press, 1998).

## **6. Individualism and Rights Discourse in the 1950s**

Daphne Barak-Erez, *Outlawed Pigs: Law, Religion and Culture in Israel*(Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 2007).

Daniel J. Elazar, *Constitutionalism: The Israeli and American Experiences* (Lanham: University Press of America, 1990).

*The History of Law in a Multicultural Society: Israel 1917-1967*, (Ron Harris et al. eds, Dartmouth: Ashgate, 2002).

Gary J. Jacobsohn, *Apple of Gold: Constitutionalism in Israel and the United States* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1993).

*Israel: The First Decade of Independence* (S. I. Troen and N. Lucas eds., Albany: SUNY: Press, 1995).

## **7. Land in 1950s Israel**

Jeremy Forman, "Military Rule, Political Manipulation, and Jewish Settlement: Israeli Mechanisms for Controlling Nazareth in the 1950s," *Journal of Israeli History* 25 (2006): 335-359

Jeremy Forman, "Law and the Historical Geography of the Galilee: Israel's Litigatory Advantages during the Special operation of Land Settlement," *Journal of Historical Geography* 32 (2006): 796-817.

Yifat Holzman Gazit, *Land Expropriation in Israel: Law, Culture and Society* (Dartmouth: Ashgate, 2007).

Ian Lustick, *Arabs in a Jewish State: Israel's Control of a National Minority* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1980).

Ronen Shamir, "Suspended in Space: Bedouins under the Law of Israel." *Law and Society Review* 30 (1996): 231-258.

Oren Yiftachel, "Israeli Society and Jewish-Palestinian Reconciliation: 'Ethnocracy' and Its Territorial Contradictions." *Middle East Journal*, 51 (1997):505-519.



## **8. Memory and Representation**

Leora Bilsky, *Transformative Justice: Israeli Identity on Trial* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2004).

Tom Segev, *The Seventh Million: Israelis and the Holocaust* (New York : Hill and Wang, 1993).

Hanna Yablonka, "The Development of Holocaust Consciousness in Israel: The Nuremberg, Kapos, Kastner and Eichmann Trials," *Israel Studies* 8 (2003): 1-24.

## **9. Consumption and the History of Everyday Life**

Liora Gvion, "Cuisines of poverty as means of empowerment: Arab food in Israel," *Agriculture and Human Values* 23 (2006): 299–312.

Guy Seidman, "Unexceptional for Once: Austerity and Food Rationing in Israel 1939-1959," *Southern California Interdisciplinary Law Journal* 18 (2008): 95-130.

## **10. Body and Hygiene**

Nadav Davidovitz & Avital Margalit, "Public Health, Racial Tensions, and Body Politics: Mass Ringworm Irradiation in Israel 1949-1960," *Journal of Law, Medicine and Ethics* 36 (2008): 522-529.

*Sport, Politics and Society in the Land of Israel: Past and Present* (Yair Galily and Amir Ben-porat eds., London: Routledge; 2009).

Haim Kaufman, "Jewish Sports in the Diaspora, Yishuv, and Israel: Between Nationalism and Politics," *Israel Studies* 10 (2005): 147-167.