

## **Becoming Israel: War, Peace, and the Politics of Israel's Identity**

Professor Emanuel Adler  
University of Toronto

E-mail Address: emanuel.adler@utoronto.ca

Israelis probably are among the few peoples in the world who, even after several generations of independent existence, still ask: "who were we?," "who are we?," "who is we?," "what are we?," "where are we?," and "who will we become?" Attempting to show why this is so, this course introduces students to Israeli politics, society, institutions and political practice from the distinctive perspective of the development of Israeli identity (identities). Special attention will be given to the sources of Israeli identity, the main players involved in its politics, and the role of regional war and the peace process in its development and inner conflicts. In particular, the course will trace the construction of Israeli identity, starting from the early times of Zionism and ending with the contemporary identity conflicts over the Oslo peace process with the Palestinians. I will try to show that there is a direct connection between Zionist constituting ideologies, the nature of Israel's institutions and society, and the split soul of Israeli identity.

**Course requirements:** A mid-term paper (40%), which is due on October 16, 2002 and a final exam (60%). Other than due to medical emergencies, no late assignments will be accepted.

### **Required Bibliography**

Adam Garfinkle, *Politics and Society in Modern Israel*. Second Edition (Armonk, New York: Sharpe, 2000).

Yaron Ezrahi, *Rubber Bullets: Power and Conscience in Modern Israel* (Berkeley and London: University of California Press, 1997).

Yael Zerubavel, *Recovered Roots: Collective Memory and the Making of Israeli National Tradition* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1995).

Laurence J. Silberstein, *The Postzionist Debates: Knowledge and Power in Israeli Culture* (New York and London: Routledge, 1999)

(These books are available at U of T bookstore, Koffler Center)

Copies of required and recommended readings are available on two hours short-term loan in the reserve stacks of Robarts library. Some items can also be found at Robarts as non-circulating periodicals. The Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science (AAPSS) and the American Political Science Review can be accessed on line

from the library website. A few items can also be found at the "Trinity College" library located at the Munk Center for International Studies.

## **Course Topics and Readings**

### **I- Introduction**

#### **Week 1: "Under Construction": Israeli Identity/Identities**

Garfinkle, chapter 1 and 2.

Recommended:

Gideon Shimoni, *The Zionist Ideology* (Hanover: Brandeis University Press, 1995), 3-11.

### **II- Who Were We?**

#### **Week 2: Zionism and the Intellectual Origins of Israeli Identity**

Shlomo Avineri, *The Making of Modern Zionism: The Intellectual Origins of the Jewish State* (New York: Basic Books, 1981), 88-100, 112-124, 139-216.

#### **Week 3: Myths and Reality in the Construction of the Modern State of Israel**

Garfinkle, chapter 3.

Zerubavel, 13-36, 39-47, 147-167

Recommended:

Amos Oz, "The Meaning of Homeland," in Carol Diamant, ed., *Zionism: The Sequel* (New York: Hadassah, 1998), 248-254.

Oz Almog, *The Sabra: The Creation of the New Jew*, trans. by Haim Watzman (Berkeley and London: University of California Press, 2000), 35-45, 185-197.

Zeev Sternhell, *The Founding Myths of Israel*. Trans. by David Maisel (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1998), 3-24.  
Zerubavel, 60-76, 192-213.

Nachman Ben-Yehuda, *The Massada Myth: Collective Memory and Mythmaking in Israel* (Madison: The University of Wisconsin Press, 1995), 62-68, 228-258.

Myron J. Aranoff, "The Origins of Israeli Political Culture," in Ehud Sprinzak and Larry Diamond, eds., *Israeli Democracy Under Stress* (Boulder, Colo.: Lynne Rienner, 1993), 47-63.

For a political-geographic introduction of the "New Yishuv" see: Ruth Kark and Joseph B. Glass, "The Jews in Eretz Israel/Palestine: From Traditional Peripherality to Modern Centrality," in Efraim Karsh, ed., *Israel: The First Hundred Years*, Vol. 1 Israel's Transition From Community to State (London: Frank Cass, 2000), 73-107.

### **III- Who Are We?**

#### **Week 4: The Israeli State, Institutions, and Identity**

Garfinkle, chapter 5.

Baruch Kimmerling, "State Building, State Autonomy and the Identity of Society: The Case of the Israeli State," *Journal of Historical Sociology* 6/4 (December 1993), 396-429.

Recommended:

Alan Dowty, "Zionism's Greatest Conceit," *Israel Studies* 3/1 (Spring 1998), 1-23.

Ilan Peleg, "Israel Constitutional Order and *Kulturkampf*: The Role of Ben-Gurion," *Israel Studies* 3/1 (Spring 1998), 230-250.

Rebecca Kook, "Between Uniqueness and Exclusion: The Politics of Identity in Israel in Comparative Perspective," in Michael Barnett, ed., *Israel in Comparative Perspective: Challenging the Conventional Wisdom* (Albany, New York: SUNY, 1996), 199-225.

#### **Week 5: The Israeli People, Society, Economy, and Identity**

Garfinkle, chapter 4.

Yair Aharoni, "The Changing Political Economy of Israel," *The Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science (AAPSS)* 555 (January 1998), 127-146.

Recommended:

Yael Yishai, "Civil Society in Transition: Interest Politics in Israel," *AAPSS* 555 (January 1998), 147-162.

Motti Regev, "To Have a Culture of Our Own: On Israeliness and Its Variants," *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 23/2 (March 2000), 223-247.

Joel S. Migdal, "Society Formation and the Case of Israel," in Michael Barnett, ed., *Israel in Comparative Perspective: Challenging the Conventional Wisdom* (Albany, New York: SUNY, 1996), 173-197.

Baruch Kimmerling, "Political Subcultures and Civilian Militarism in a Settler-Immigrant Society," in Daniel Bar-Tal, Dan Jacobson and Aharon Klieman, eds., *Society Concerns: Insights from the Israeli Experience*. Contemporary Studies in Sociology, Vol. 17 (Stamford, Conn.: JAI Press, 1998), 395-416.

#### **IV- Who Is "We?"**

##### **Week 6: "Jerusalem" and "Tel-Aviv:" The Split Soul of Israeli Identity**

Ezrahi, chapters, 5, 7, and 10.

Recommended:

Ezrahi, chapter 1.

##### **Week 7: "Kulturkampf:" The Secular Religious Divide**

Baruch Kimmerling, "Between Hegemony and Dormant *Kulturkampf* in Israel," *Israel Affairs* 4/3&4 (Spring/Summer 1998). Also in Dan Urian and Efraim Karsh, eds., *In Search of Identity: Jewish Aspects in Israeli Culture* (London: Frank Cass, 1998), 49-72.

Asher Cohen and Bernard Susser, *Israel and the Politics of Jewish Identity* (Baltimore and London: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 2000), chapters 1 and 2.

Recommended:

Ehud Sprinzak, "Extremism and Violence in Israel: The Crisis of Messianic Politics," *AAPSS* 555 (January 1998), 114-126.

Aviezer Ravitzky, *Messianism, Zionism, and Jewish Religious Radicalism*, trans. by Michael Swirsky and Jonathan Chipman (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1996), chapter 1.

##### **Week 8: "Post-Zionism," the "New Historians," and Israeli Identity**

Silberstein, chapters 2, 3, and 4.

Recommended:

Menachem Brinker, "The End of Zionism? Thoughts on the Wages of Success," in Carol Diament, ed., *Zionism: The Sequel* (New York: Hadassah, 1998), 293-299.

Erik Cohen, "Israel as a Post-Zionist Society," in Robert Witrich and David Ohana, eds., *The Shaping of Israeli Identity: Myths, Memory, and Trauma* (London: Frank Cass, 1995), 203-213.

Yoram Hazony, *The Jewish State: Struggle for Israel's Soul* (New York: Basic, 2000), chapters 1 and 2.

Silberstein, chapter 5.

Some examples of the "new historians" writings:

Benny Morris, *Righteous Victims: A History of the Zionist-Arab Conflict 1881-1999* (New York: Knopf, 1999).

Ilan Pappé, *The Making of the Arab-Israeli Conflict: 1947-1951* (London: I. B. Tauris, 1992).

Avi Shlaim, *The Iron Wall: Israel and the Arab World* (New York: W. W. Norton, 2000).

Gershon Shafir, *Land, Labor and the Origins of the Israeli-Palestinian Conflict: 1882-1914* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989).

### **Week 9: The Israeli Palestinians: "Us" or "Them?"**

Sammy Smooha, "Minority Status in an Ethnic Democracy: The Status of the Arab Minority in Israel," *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 13/3 (July 1990), 389-413.

Yoav Peled, "Ethnic Democracy and the Legal Construction of Citizenship: Arab Citizens of the Jewish State," *American Political Science Review* 86/2 (June 1992), 432-443.

Nadim Rouhana and Asad Ghanem, "The Crisis of Minorities in Ethnic States: The Case of Palestinian Citizens in Israel," *International Journal of Middle East Studies* 30 (1998), 321-346.

"We are at a Crossroads," Interview with Azmi Bishara by Ilan Amouyal, revised 1998 by Azmi Bishara, in Carol Diament, ed., *Zionism: The Sequel* (New York: Hadassah, 1998), 279-286.

Recommended:

Mark Tessler and Audra K. Grant, "Israel's Arab Citizens: The Continuing Struggle," *AAPSS* 555 (January 1998), 97-113.

Dan Rabinowitz, *Overlooking Nazareth: The Ethnography of Exclusion in Galilee* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997), chapters 2 and 5.

## **V- What Are We?**

### **Week 10: Israeli Democracy as Identity**

Ruth Gavison, "Jewish and Democratic? A Rejoinder to the 'Ethnic Democracy' Debate," *Israel Studies* 4/1 (Spring 1999), 44-72.

Charles S. Liebman, "Religion and Democracy in Israel," in Ehud Sprinzak and Larry Diamond, eds., *Israeli Democracy Under Stress* (Boulder, Colo.: Lynne Rienner, 1993), 273-291.

Baruch Kimmerling, "Religion, Nationalism and Democracy in Israel," *Constellations* 6/3 (1999), 339-363.

Recommended:

Alan Dowty, "Is Israel Democratic? Substance and Semantics in the Ethnic Democracy Debate," *Israel Studies* 4/2 (Fall 1999), 1-15.

Sammy Smooha, "Ethnic Democracy: Israel as an Archetype," *Israel Studies* 2/2 (Fall 1997), 198-241.

Yonathan Shapiro, "The Historical Origins of Israeli Democracy," in Ehud Sprinzak and Larry Diamond, eds., *Israeli Democracy Under Stress* (Boulder, Colo.: Lynne Rienner, 1993), 65-81.

Gabriel Sheffer, "Has Israel Really Been a Garrison State? Sources of Change in Israel's Democracy," *Israel Affairs* 3/1 (Autumn 1996), 13-38.

### **Week 11: War, Peace and Israeli Identity**

Garfinkle, 199-228, 245-278, 289-296.  
Ezrahi, chapter 9.

Michael Barnett, "Culture, Strategy and Foreign Policy Change: Israel's Road to Oslo," *European Journal of International Relations* 5/1 (March 1999), 5-36.

Recommended:

Ezrahi, chapters 6 and 8.

Lilly Weissbrod, "Israeli Identity in Transition," in Efraim Karsh, ed., *From Rabin to Netanyahu: Israel's Troubled Agenda* (London: Frank Cass, 1997), 47-65.

Michael Freige, "Peace Now and the Legitimation Crisis of 'Civil Militarism,'" *Israel Studies* 3/1 (Spring 1998), 85-111.

Ehud Sprinzak, *Brother Against Brother: Violence and Extremism in Israeli Politics from Altalena to the Rabin Assassination* (New York: The Free Press, 1999), chapter 5.

Avishai Margalit, *Views in Review: Politics and Culture in the State of the Jews* (New York: Farrar, Straus, Giroux, 1998), chapter 7.

## **VI- Where Are We?**

### **Week 12: The Politics of Israel's Regional Identity**

Shimon Peres, *The New Middle East* (New York: Henry Holt and Co., 1993), 61-85, 163-179.

David Ohana, "Israel Towards a Mediterranean Identity," in Shlomo Avineri and Werner Weidenfeld, eds., *Integration and Identity: Challenges to Europe and Israel* (Bonn: Europa Union Verlag, 1999), 81-99.

Recommended:

Elie Podeh, "Rethinking Israel in the Middle East," in Efraim Karsh, ed., *From Rabin to Netanyahu: Israel's Troubled Agenda* (London: Frank Cass, 1997), 280-295.

Bernard Lewis, *The Multiple Identities of the Middle East* (New York: Schocken, 1998), chapter 9.

Joel Peters, *Pathways to Peace: The Multilateral Arab-Israeli Peace Talks* (London: Royal Institute of International Affairs, 1996), 1-11, 61-75.

## **VII- Who Will We Become?**

### **Week 13: The Alternative Paths of Israeli Identity/Identities**

Ezrahi, chapter 11.

Emanuel Adler, "Changing Identities: The Path to Peace," First Andrea and Charles Bronfman Lecture in Israeli Studies, Munk Center for International Studies, University of Toronto, March, 21, 2002 (mimeo).

Recommended:

Shlomo Avineri, "Israel-A Normative Value of Jewish Existence," in Carol Diament, ed., *Zionism: The Sequel* (New York: Hadassah, 1998), 85-88.

Zeev Sternhell, *The Founding Myths of Israel*. Trans. by David Maisel (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1998), Epilogue.

### **Additional Bibliography**

#### **Books**

Arian, Asher (1995) *Security Threatened*. New York: Cambridge University Press.

Arian, Asher (1998) *The Second Republic: Politics in Israel*. New Jersey: Chatham House.

Arian, Asher (2002) *Executive Governance in Israel*. Palgrave.

Aronoff, Myron J. (1989) *Israeli Visions and Divisions*. New Brunswick: Transaction.

Avishai, Bernard (1985) *The Tragedy of Zionism: Revolution and Democracy in the Land of Israel*. New York: Farrar, Straus, Giroux.

Avruch, Kevin and Walter P. Zenner (eds.) (1997) *Critical Essays on Israeli Society, Religion, and Government*. Albany, New York: SUNY.

Barnett, Michael (1992) *Confronting the Costs of War: Military Power, State, and Society in Egypt and Israel*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Beilin, Yossi (1999) *Touching Peace: From the Oslo Accord to a Final Agreement*. London: Weidenfeld and Nicolson.

Benvenisti, Meron (2000) *The Buried History of the Holy Land since 1948*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Cohen, Avner (1998) *Israel and the Bomb*. New York: Columbia University Press.

Cohen, Eric, Moshe Lissak, and Uri Almagor (eds.) (1985) *Comparative Social Dynamics*. Boulder, Colo.: Westview Press.



- Dowty, Allan et al. (1997) *The Role of Domestic Politics in Israeli Peacemaking*. Jerusalem: Leonard Davis Institute, Hebrew University of Jerusalem.
- Dowty, Allan (1998) *The Jewish State One Hundred Years Later*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Drainie, Bronwyn (1995) *My Jerusalem*. New York: Doubleday.
- Eisenstadt, Shmuel N. (1986) *The Transformation of Israeli Society: An Essay in Interpretation*. Boulder, Colo.: Westview Press.
- Elon, Amos (1981) *The Israelis: Founders and Sons*. Jerusalem: Adam.
- Elizur, Judith N. and Elihu Katz (1998) 2d edition. *The Theater of Redemption: Israel's Images and their Functions*. Jerusalem: S.N.
- Etzioni-Halevi, Eva with Rita Shapira (1977) *Political Culture in Israel: Cleavage and Integration among Israeli Jews*. New York: Praeger.
- Evron, Boaz (1995) *Jewish State of Israeli Nation?* Bloomington: Indiana University Press.
- Freedman Robert O. (ed.) (2000) *Israel's First Fifty Years*. University Press of Florida.
- Finkelstein, Norman (2001) *Image and Reality of the Israeli Palestinian Conflict*. Verso.
- Gorny, Yosef (1994) *Israel in Jewish Public Thought: The Quest for Collective Identity*. New York: New York University Press.
- Grossman, David (1989) *The Yellow Wind*. New York: Delta.
- Hermann, Tamar and Ephraim Yuchtman-Yaar (eds.) (1997) *Israeli Society and the Challenge of Transition to Co-existence*. Tel Aviv: The Tami Steinmetz Center for Peace Research, Tel Aviv University.
- Hertzberg, Arthur (1997) *The Zionist Idea: A Historical Analysis and Reader*. Philadelphia and Jerusalem: The Jewish Publication Society.
- Horovitz, David (2000) *A Little Too Close to God: The Thrills and Panic of a Life in Israel*. New York: Knopf.
- Horowitz, Don and Moshe Lissak (1978) *Origins of the Israeli Polity*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Horowitz, Don and Moshe Lissak (1989) *Trouble in Utopia: the Overburdened Polity of Israel*. Albany, SUNY Press.

- Karsh, Efraim (1997) *Fabricating Israeli History: The "New Historians"* London: Frank Cass.
- Karsh, Efraim (ed.) (2000) *Israel: The First Hundred Years. Vol. II From War to Peace?* London: Frank Cass.
- Khalidi, Rashid (1997) *Palestinian Identity: The Construction of Modern National Consciousness*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Kimmerling, Baruch (1983) *Zionism and Territory: The Socio-Territorial Dimension of Zionist Politics*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Kimmerling, Baruch (ed.) (1989) *The Israeli State and Society: Boundaries and Frontiers*. Albany, New York: SUNY.
- Kimmerling, Baruch (ed.) (2001) *The Invention and Decline of Israeliness: State, Society, and the Military*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Kimmerling, Baruch and Joel Migdal (1993) *Palestinians: The Making of a People*. New York: the Free Press.
- Kyle, Keith and Joel Peters (eds.) (1993) *Whither Israel? The Domestic Challenges*. London: I.B. Tauris.
- Laqueur, Walter (1972) *A History of Zionism: From the French Revolution to the Establishment of the State of Israel*. New York: MJF Books.
- Levi-Faur, David, Gabriel Sheffer and David Vogel (eds.) (2000) *Israel: The Dynamics of Change and Continuity*. London: Frank Cass.
- Liebman, Charles S. and Eliezer Don-Yehiya (1983) *Civil Religion in Israel: Traditional Judaism and Political Culture in the Jewish State*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Liebman, Charles S. and Elihu Katz (eds.) (1997) *The Jewishness of Israelis*. Albany, New York: SUNY.
- Lowsky-Feder, Edna and Eyal Ben-Ari (eds.) (2000) *The Military and Militarism in Israeli Society*. Albany, New York: SUNY.
- Lustick, Ian (1988) *From the Land of the Lord: Jewish Fundamentalism in Israel*. New York: Council on Foreign Relations.
- Lustick, Ian (1995) *Unsettled States, Disputed Lands*. Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press.

Lustick, Ian S. and Barry Rubin (eds.) *Critical Essays on Israeli Society, Politics and Culture*. Albany, New York: SUNY.

Medding Peter Y. (1990) *The Founding of Israeli Democracy 1948-1967*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Medding Peter Y (ed.) (1989) *Israel: State and Society 1948-1988*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Migdal, Joel (2001) *Through the Lens of Israel: Explorations of State and Society*. Albany, New York: SUNY.

Morris, Benny (1987) *The Birth of the Palestinian Refugee Problem 1947-1949*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Oz, Amos (1993) *In the Land of Israel*. San Diego: Harcourt Brace & Co.

Oz, Amos (1994) *Israel, Palestine and Peace: Essays*. San Diego: Harcourt Brace & Co.

Peled, Yoav and Gershon Shafir (ed.) (2001) *The New Israel: Peacemaking and Liberalization*. Boulder, Colo.: Westview Press.

Peretz, Don and Gideon Doron 3d ed. (1997) *The Government and Politics of Israel*. Boulder: Westview Press.

Ram, Uri (1995) *The Changing Agenda of Israeli Sociology: Theory, Ideology, and Identity*. Albany, New York: State University of New York Press.

Rejwan, Nissim (1998) *Israel's Place in the Middle East: a Pluralist Perspective*. Gainesville, Florida: University of Florida Press.

Rejwan, Nissim (1999) *Israel in Search of Identity: Reading the Formative Years*. Gainesville, Florida: University of Florida Press.

Rouhana, Nadim (1997) *Palestinian Citizens in an Ethnic Jewish State: Identities in Conflict*. New haven: Yale University Press.

Sachar, Howard M (1998) *Israel and Europe: an Appraisal in History*. New York: Vintage Books.

Sachar, Howard M. (2000) *A History of Israel: From the Rise of Zionism to Our Time*. 2d. ed. New York: Knopf.

Shafir, Gershon and Yoav Peled (2002) *Being Israeli: The Dynamics of Multiple Citizenship*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

- Shalev, Michael (1992) *Labour and the Political Economy of Israel*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Segev, Tom (1986) *1949: The First Israelis*. New York: the Free Press.
- Segev, Tom (1993) *The Seventh Million*. New York: Hill and Wang.
- Shimoni, Gideon (1995) *The Zionist Ideology*. Hanover, N.H.: Brandeis University Press.
- Shlaim, Avi (1988) *Collusion across the Jordan: King Abdullah, the Zionist Movement, and the Partition of Palestine*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Sicker, Martin (1992) *Judaism, Nationalism and the Land of Israel*. Boulder, Colo.: Westview Press.
- Silberstein, Laurence J. (1993) *Jewish Fundamentalism in Comparative Perspective*. New York: New York University Press.
- Smith, Charles D. (2001) 4<sup>th</sup> ed. *Palestine and the Arab-Israeli Conflict*. New York: St Martin's
- Smooha, Sammy (1992) *Arabs and Jews in Israel*. 2 vol. Boulder, Colo.: Westview Press.
- Tamir, Yael (1993) *Liberal Nationalism*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Tal, Alon (2002) *Pollution in a Promised Land: An Environmental History of Israel*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Telhami, shibley and Michael Barnett, eds. (2002) *Identity and Foreign Policy in the Middle East*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.
- Tessler, Mark (1994) *A History of the Israeli-Palestinian Conflict*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.
- Torstrick, Rebecca (2000) *The Limits of Coexistence: Identity Politics in Israel*. Ann Harbor, Michigan: University of Michigan Press.
- Yishai, Yael ( 1996) *Between the Flag and the Banner: Women and Politics in Israel*. Albany, New York: SUNY.

### **Most Relevant Journals**

*Ethnic and Racial Studies*

*History and Memory*

*International Journal of Middle East Studies*

*Israel Affairs*

*Israel Studies*

*The Jerusalem Quarterly*

*Middle East Journal*

*Philosophy and Social Criticism*

**Newspapers and Magazines**

Haaretz (English Edition, Internet) [www.haaretzdaily.com](http://www.haaretzdaily.com)

Jerusalem Post (Internet) [www.jpost.com](http://www.jpost.com)

Jerusalem Report (Internet) [www.jrep.com](http://www.jrep.com)